



International Civil Aviation Organization

**NINETEENTH MEETING OF THE COMMUNICATIONS/NAVIGATION
AND SURVEILLANCE SUB-GROUP (CNS SG/19) OF APANPIRG**

Bangkok, Thailand, 20 – 24 July 2015

Agenda Item 3: Aeronautical Fixed Service (AFS)

3.1) Review Report of the Second Meeting of the Aeronautical
Communication Services Implementation Coordination Group
(ACSICG/2) including the outcome of the Fourth Meeting of CRV
Task Force (CRV TF/4)

**FINAL REVIEW OF THE CRV
TENDER AND EVALUATION PACKAGES**

(Presented by the Secretariat)

SUMMARY

This paper introduces the tender package that was reviewed by the CRV Pioneer States before its publication on the ICAO e-procurement platform

1. Introduction

1.1 A tender package was developed by the CRV Task Force to procure network services reviewed and agreed by 15 CRV Pioneer States/Administrations on 21 and 22 July 2015.

1.2 An evaluation package was also developed by the CRV Task Force, reviewed and agreed by 15 CRV Pioneer States/Administrations CRV Pioneer States/Administrations on 21 and 22 July 2015.

1.3 Both packages are available here (secured access):
<https://portal.icao.int/CRV/2%20CRV%20project%20Tasks%20with%20deliverables/2-4%20User%20requirements%20and%20Safety%20Preliminary%20Analysis/CRV%20Tender%20Package%202023-07-15>

2. Discussion

Tender Package

2.1 The tender package delivered by Task 37-c Make user Requirements was commented by APAC States in June 2015 and consolidated by Task 44a- Review the technical specifications composed of CRV Chair, ICAO RO CNS Officer and ICAO TCB expert from 29 June to 10 July 2015.

2.2 The tender package consists of:

- Attachment I - Instructions to Tenderers
 - Annex a - Supplier Eligibility Declaration
 - Annex b- Price Schedule
 - Annex c- Study case for the purpose of financial comparison of proposals
 - Annex d- Safety requirements schedule
 - Annex e- Data Flow & Restriction Matrix schedule
 - Annex f - CRV - Individual Service Contract - template
- Attachment II Terms Of Reference (TOR)
 - Annex a – CRV CONOPs
 - Annex b - Matrix of Flows for CRV services
 - Annex c - Mapping of services for quality management
 - Annex d - SLA and penalty table
 - Annex e - CRV IRS - Core Services
 - Annex f - Optional Voice and Data Gateway Service
- Attachment III - TERMS AND CONDITIONS
- Attachment III - ICAO TERMS AND CONDITIONS

2.3 The tender package was reviewed and all comments from CRV Pioneer States addressed.

2.4 The Attachment I Annex c- Case Study for the purpose of financial comparison of proposals will be used to compare the different financial proposals from the bidders as a one-to-one comparison would not be feasible and moreover would not constitute a relevant assessment of the total cost of services over 10 years. A caveat is done to the bidders that the case study does not constitute a purchase order. It includes 2 cases.

- Case 1: all States and interregional connections, and some options: it was built to be representative enough and use many combinations of Prices from the Price Schedule, including most optional services. It has to be filled in by the Tenderers with the prices extracted from the Price Schedule. This scenario is allocated 300 points.
- Case 2: States/Administrations with poorer terrestrial connectivity. In accordance with the cost-benefit analysis. This scenario is allocated 100 points.

Based on the 2 subtotals, a total cost is then calculated that will be used in the evaluation process to compare the financial proposals for a total of 400 points.

Lastly the study case will be used by the Tenderers to demonstrate their capability to build a high level planning and mobilize adequate resources to implement CRV.

2.5 The Attachment I Annex f - CRV - Individual Service Contract – template is proposed as an annex during the procurement process but will become the main piece of the contract once signed by States/Administrations.

2.6 Attachment III - TERMS AND CONDITIONS will be used when an APAC State/Administration procures the services, which is the intended standard process. Attachment III - ICAO TERMS AND CONDITIONS may be used if ICAO TCB procures the services on behalf of a State/Administration.

2.7 Once the comments submitted by CRV Pioneer States on the tender package will be addressed, the meeting would propose the following draft decision for adoption by the CNS SG/19:

Draft Decision x/x - Publication of CRV tender package

That, considering the satisfactory review conducted by the CRV Pioneer States, the CRV tender package be published on ICAO e-procurement platform at the earliest after ICAO TCB's final review.

Evaluation package

2.8 The evaluation form delivered by **Task 37-c Make user Requirements** was commented by APAC States in June 2015 and consolidated by **Task 38 Determine Selection Process** composed of CRV Chair, ICAO RO CNS Officer and ICAO TCB expert from 29 June to 10 July 2015.

2.9 The evaluation package consists of:

- Evaluation of CRV Services form
- Guidance for CRV evaluation committee member

2.10 The form Evaluation of CRV Services is based on ICAO procurement code and practices and uses the ICAO template.

2.11 The guidance for CRV evaluation committee member refines the criteria developed in the aforementioned form to constitute a sound and fair basis for evaluation, as potentially all Pioneer States may want to contribute to the evaluation process.

2.12 Concerning the process (evaluation plan) the following was agreed by CRV Pioneer States:

Pre-evaluation phase

- Groups are constituted as follows, based on the successful experience with RFI (Request For Information)
 - **GROUP 1:**
 - TECHNICAL CRITERIA 1 - Corporate Experience and Capability
 - TECHNICAL CRITERIA 2 - Proposed Work Plan and Approach
 - **GROUP 2:**
 - TECHNICAL CRITERIA 3 - Skill and Experience of Personnel
 - TECHNICAL CRITERIA 4 - Additional Criteria (Network design and user's interface, Configuration management, Fault management, Security management, Monitoring and reporting, Training, optional gateway service)

- **GROUP 3:** Financial criteria
 - 1 member can contribute to 1 to 3 groups
 - Technical criteria: this member prepares his/her pre-evaluation form before the evaluation meeting (for groups 1 and 2)

Evaluation committee

- Limit the participation to 1 member by State/Administration
- Based on the inputs from members, a score is given to all criteria in accordance with the guidance. If based on discussions a score cannot be given for a specific criterion, then the average of all notes for that criterion will be retained.
- for the financial criteria no pre-evaluation has to be carried out as the Case study will be directly used to evaluate the financial criteria for each tender.

2.13 The evaluation form will be reviewed by ICAO in accordance with the ICAO procurement code.

3. Action by the Meeting

3.1 The meeting is invited to:

- a) note the information contained in this paper;
- b) discuss the draft decision developed in the paragraph 2.7 and proposed for adoption by the CNS SG/19; and
- c) discuss any other relevant matters as appropriate.
